# MIDDLESBROUGH COUNCIL

# **AGENDA ITEM 7**

# **OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD**

# 5 FEBRUARY 2013

# FINAL REPORT OF ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY PANEL - ENERGY REDUCTION AND ENVIRONMENTAL AWARENESS OF LOCAL BODIES

# PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

1. To present the Environment Scrutiny Panel's findings, conclusions and recommendations following its investigation of the topic of Energy Reduction and Environmental Awareness of Local Bodies.

### BACKGROUND

- 2. In the face of continuing rises in energy costs (<sup>1</sup>retail energy prices have more than doubled in under seven years) the scrutiny panel decided to speak to other local bodies who are major energy consumers. This was with a view to comparing how other organisations have approached the issues of energy and carbon reduction and to consider whether there were any examples of best practice that could be shared between organisations. This exercise followed an examination of energy reduction in Middlesbrough Council that the scrutiny panel undertook during 2010.
- 3. In order to provide some context in respect of the scrutiny panel's current work, reference is made to the panel's earlier work in the following section of the report.

#### Previous Findings of the Environment Scrutiny Panel

4. The final report that was produced by the scrutiny panel in 2010 highlighted the importance of energy reduction and included the following key points:

See box on the following page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Telegraph: 'Manchester councils in collective energy move' - 18 December 2012

### Key points from 2010 Environment Scrutiny Panel Final Report on Energy Reduction

- In recent years the debate on climate change has shifted from whether we need to act, to how much we need to do, and how quickly. There is unequivocal evidence that global warming is taking place. The United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on climate change has concluded that there is more than a 90% certainty that climate change is caused by human activity. Atmospheric levels of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>), the main greenhouse gas, have already increased by 36% since the industrial revolution and the concentration is accelerating as global emissions increase. Storms, droughts, flooding and heat waves will become more intense and sea levels will rise significantly over the next 50 to 100 years. The extent to which these events are minimised is dependent on speedy interventions by both national governments and local communities.
- Almost £6m was spent on supplying energy and water to Council buildings (including schools) in 2008/09 and around 24,000 tonnes of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) produced. The scrutiny panel welcomes work which has been done, and which is ongoing within the Council, in terms of energy reduction and the linked issue of climate change. The panel is pleased to see that wide-ranging action has been taken, or is planned. While recognising that more can be done, and that this work needs to be continued and built on, this approach is welcomed.
- Using less energy is one of the most effective and economical environmental actions that individuals and organisations can take. It not only reduces the demand for fossil fuels, with consequent environmental benefits, but also results in financial savings, which is also important given current public sector spending constraints. Energy reduction can therefore be deemed a 'win win' situation.
- The Council took action in respect of climate change and energy reduction some years ago by developing its Climate Change Community Action Plan. The authority has since approved a Sustainability Policy, which includes adoption of the 'One Planet Living' model, and is now taking action in a number of areas to reduce energy use.
- The introduction of the Carbon Reduction Commitment for large organisations, as well as introducing financial incentives to reduce energy use, raises the importance of the Council having a longer term planning framework for the wider issue of climate change.
- 5. The panel's 2010 final report included four recommendations, which related to
  - i. Endorsing the Council's approach to energy reduction and climate change.
  - ii. Publicising the importance of energy saving by all Council employees and encouraging changes in behaviour and culture.
  - iii. Undertaking work to collate energy use figures on an individual Council building and departmental/service area basis and to validate meter readings and energy bills for all Council buildings. The introduction of departmental 'energy champions' was also suggested.
  - iv. Updating the scrutiny panel on progress.

- 6. On 22 June 2010 all of these recommendations were approved by the Executive and in January 2012 the scrutiny panel received an update on progress. The progress report showed that:
  - a) Between 2009-10 and 2010-11 there was an overall reduction of 5.51% in fuel (electricity and gas) usage. This was despite colder weather than normal during the period.
  - b) Electricity usage increased by 3.19% during the period due to a number of reasons, including street lighting being added to metered supplies.
  - c) There was an overall reduction of 0.83% in carbon dioxide ( $CO_2$ ) emissions in the same period.
  - d) A working group had been established to further progress these issues and to gather data on the use of gas, electricity and water at each Council site.
  - e) Energy Champions had also been created to act as a point of contact for staff to suggest how energy could be saved.
  - f) CO<sub>2</sub> emissions had been reduced by using various funding sources to improve insulation to walls and roof spaces and replace windows, as well as by replacing boilers, improving thermostatic control and using energy-efficient lighting and sensor controls.

#### **Current Scrutiny Investigation**

- Over the course of four meetings held between 29 August and 3 December 2012, the Environment Scrutiny Panel heard from representatives of the following organisations:
  - Teesside University
  - Fabrick Housing Group
  - Cleveland Police
  - South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust
- 8. A record of discussions at panel meetings, including agenda, minutes and reports, is available from the Council's Egenda system, which can be accessed via the Council's website at www.middlesbrough.gov.uk.
- 9. This report has been compiled on the basis of information submitted to the scrutiny panel by Council officers and representatives of Teesside University, Cleveland Police, The Fabrick Group and South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust.
- 10. The membership of the scrutiny panel was as follows:

Councillors Kerr (Chair); Clark (Vice-Chair), Brady, Cole, Davison, C Hobson, McPartland, Saunders and P Sharrocks.

### THE SCRUTINY PANEL'S FINDINGS

- 11. The scrutiny panel's findings are set out in respect of each organisation, as follows:
  - a) Teesside University
  - b) Fabrick Housing Group
  - c) Cleveland Police
  - d) South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust

#### **Teesside University**

- 12. Information was submitted by the representatives of Teesside University in respect of energy and carbon reduction as shown in the following paragraphs.
- 13. In 2005, the University identified carbon and energy reduction as issues to be addressed. And, at that time, signed up to the Government's Carbon Trust Higher Education Carbon Reduction Programme. Teesside joined 19 other Universities in a voluntary pilot programme that sought to:
  - a) Reduce carbon dioxide and the impacts of climate change
  - b) Respond to Government pressure to reduce emissions
  - c) Create a positive 'green' image for the higher education sector.
  - d) Build on energy conservation work already started.
  - e) Reduce energy costs and create savings elsewhere.
- 14. Although initial progress in reducing energy consumption was slow, there has since been a gradual change in terms of culture and staff/student engagement. This has been achieved through education, changes in working practices and implementation of a range of initiatives. As a result, the University was awarded the Carbon Trust Standard in 2010. This requires organisations to measure, manage and reduce carbon emissions in the workplace.
- 15. In order to achieve the standard, a number of different measures to reduce energy use and carbon emissions had been introduced, such as:
  - a) Replacing inefficient boilers;
  - b) Installing automatic lighting;
  - c) Use of double glazing;
  - d) Installing cavity wall insulation and re-cladding older buildings;
  - e) Installing voltage regulation to main electricity supplies;
  - f) Installing temperature control and cooling equipment;
  - g) Introduction of an Energy Policy;
  - h) Production of a Carbon Management Plan;
  - i) Undertaking staff and student energy briefings and education programmes;
  - j) Educating and publicising the need for staff to turn off computers and introducing automatic shutdown of computer equipment;
  - k) Installation of water-efficient toilets and taps;
  - I) Reducing the number of IT servers.
  - m) Use of natural ventilation.

- 16. Reference was also made to the People and Planet Green League. This is a student network that campaigns to end poverty, promote human rights and protect the environment. The People and Planet League ranks organisations on the same basis as an academic degree classification according to 13 different criteria. These are designed to assess an organisation's commitment to environmental management and cover areas such as environmental policy; environmental auditing and management systems; carbon management; energy sources; waste and recycling; and carbon reduction.
- 17. In accordance with the above criteria, the University has introduced a number of different policies including an Environmental Sustainable Policy; a Fair Trade Policy; a General Policy; a Waste Management Policy, a Transport and Travel Policy, an Ethical Investment Policy; an Emissions and Discharge Policy and a Sustainable Procurement Policy. As a result, Teesside University was awarded a 2:1 classification in 2012, which was an improved score from the previous year.
- 18. The Scrutiny Panel was advised that the introduction of a monitoring and targeting software package has been significant in reducing energy consumption. The system records energy and water consumption throughout the University and is closely monitored on a daily basis to identify areas of high energy usage or surges in consumption. Action is then taken as necessary, such as by identifying areas where electric or electronic equipment is being used unnecessarily. An officer has been appointed to oversee the system and associated action.
- 19. It was explained that the system has also allowed the University to align the academic timetable to the heating system to ensure that heating and lighting are only turned on when rooms are in use.
- 20. Reference was also made to the Government's Carbon Reduction Commitment which requires large energy consumers to pay a levy per kilo of carbon emitted. Under this scheme, the University paid a levy of £115k for the current year, although this sum is refundable, plus a bonus, if the organisation can demonstrate and prove that it has reduced carbon emissions by the end of the year. It was advised that carbon emissions have been reduced by 4.9% up to 31 July 2012 with a saving of approximately £100k on the University's energy bill.
- 21. In terms of staff engagement, the University has appointed a body comprising representatives of each of its six schools and 13 departments to liaise on environmental matters, in particular energy reduction. The group is also in contact with Middlesbrough Environment City.
- 22. In addition to energy reduction, the University is also committed to improvements on other environmental and sustainability issues, such as promoting and encouraging green travel, environmental protection and minimising emissions and discharges.
- 23. Some work has also been undertaken on the feasibility of introducing small-scale photo-voltaic schemes, although following changes to feed-in tariffs etc the future position is not entirely clear.

#### Fabrick Housing Group

- 24. Information was submitted by the representative of the Fabrick Housing Group in respect of energy and carbon reduction as shown in the following sections of the report.
- 25. In 2009/10 the Board of Fabrick had determined that energy reduction should be addressed as a priority. As a result, and following discussions with Middlesbrough Council, the organisation adopted the authority's One Planet Living Strategy. In early 2011, Fabrick developed its own Group-wide Strategy, which outlines the organisation's plans in respect of reducing energy consumption and its carbon footprint from 2011-15. A five-year action plan has been adopted to progress the strategy, which covers both office buildings and letting properties in the group's ownership.
- 26. It was explained that Fabrick initially focussed on issues that could be addressed immediately, such as reducing energy consumption and wastage in its office buildings and communal areas. A campaign headed 'You're in Control' was launched, which aims to promote switching off electronic office equipment such as PCs and photocopiers each evening. A group of 40 energy champions has been established, made up of 30 staff and 10 residents. A simple but effective scheme has involved 'name and shame,' with stickers being placed on PCs, photocopiers and lights that are not switched off after 5.00pm.
- 27. At the start of the three-month campaign, approximately 50% of PCs and photocopiers were found to be left switched on; after three weeks, 75% were being switched off; and most recent analysis shows that 96% are now switched off every night. The campaign has been very inexpensive but has proved most effective in producing instant energy savings it is estimated that switching off of PCs can save up to £50 per machine per year. Fabrick also has energy supplied by one supplier, which has provided further savings.
- 28. Reference was also made to the new Fabrick Headquarters at Riverside House, Middlesbrough. This is an all-electric building with automatic power-down at 7.00pm. By adding Photovoltaic (PV) panels (solar heating) on the roof of the building, its carbon footprint has been reduced by around 36%. This has been achieved through a relatively small capital investment. In addition, a 46% reduction in the carbon footprint at the Cargo Fleet Lane buildings has also been achieved, although this has partly been as a result of them being occupied by fewer staff.
- 29. Following questions from the scrutiny panel in respect of residential properties, it was confirmed that Fabrick has offered a number of initiatives such as cavity wall and loft insulation and lighting schemes to help residents to reduce their energy bills. A trials of LED lighting was also taking place in one Fabrick building. Although this is more expensive to install than traditional lighting, it uses less energy and is cheaper to maintain. Monitoring and assessment will be undertaken to identify financial savings and determine whether the use of LED lighting will be expanded in the group.

- 30. In addition, Fabrick is currently examining energy costs at its high-rise buildings. An energy efficiency calculation is made for all of the group's housing properties with the stock overall being in the top 20% in the UK for energy efficiency. However, it is now at the point where the more difficult issues need to be addressed - for example, boiler replacements in some of the older stock. As some houses are heated by expensive electric heating/night storage heating, Fabrick is examining all alternatives, such as more efficient gas boilers or <sup>2</sup>air source heat pumps, particularly in properties with no gas services.
- 31. Funding has also been made available for external wall insulation in some situations and possible uses of this are being explored. In addition, a feasibility study on further use of photovoltaic panels is to be undertaken.
- 32. In terms of Fabrick's new-build properties, it was explained that these are currently being built to at least Level 3 of the national <sup>3</sup>Code for Sustainable Homes, with some properties been built to the higher Levels 4 and 5. Six new build properties have recently been commissioned at Level 5 although it is estimated that it can cost an extra £50,000 to build to level 5 compared to level 3.
- 33. Other work being undertaken by the organisation focuses on staff training on energy reduction and efficiency and rolling the information out to residents via Housing Officers, literature, the internet and resident group meetings.
- 34. The 2012 update of Fabrick's Sustainability Strategy, which is based on the Ten Principles of One Planet Living, was made available to the scrutiny panel for information.
- 35. During the panel's discussion, reference was also made to the following energy reduction and environmental issues concerning Fabrick:
  - a) A number of electricity monitors have been purchased to help residents understand their energy consumption and highlight which appliances were costing the most to run. The monitors are currently being used in 40 properties and will then be passed on to other residents.
  - b) All new-build properties now have water meters installed. However, there are no plans to install water meters in older properties.
  - c) Fabrick has a dedicated 'Tandem' Team that provides support and advice to residents on energy bills and which can assist them in ensuring that they are on the correct/cheapest tariff with their energy supplier.
  - d) Fabrick is not considering encouraging residents to group together to seek out a single energy supplier on the best tariff, or facilitating the collective purchasing of energy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In domestic heating use, an air source heat pump absorbs heat from outside air and releases it inside during winter. It can often do the converse for cooling purposes in summer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Code for Sustainable Homes, which complements the existing system of Energy Performance Certificates, has been developed to enable a step change to be made in sustainable building practice for new homes.

#### **Cleveland Police**

- 36. Information was submitted by the representatives of Cleveland Police in respect of energy and carbon reduction as shown in the following paragraphs.
- 37. The scrutiny panel heard that Cleveland Police spends approximately £1 million per year on energy (60% electricity and 40% gas). The force's estates/buildings management team, which is an outsourced service provided by Steria, is responsible for energy reduction. Although there is no specialist energy manager, the Estates Team Manager is responsible for this function, which continues to examine how best to encourage energy reduction, such as through cultural change and liaison with energy consultants.
- 38. The service aims to reduce energy consumption and carbon waste by 20% over the next five years.
- 39. The force now takes an outward looking view of energy reduction. For example, a Benchmarking Group has been established for reporting purposes in order to compare with other police areas. The Panel was advised that, for comparison purposes, Cleveland Police is grouped with West Yorkshire, Merseyside and Mercia forces as they are all of a similar size. Cleveland generally performs on a par with the other forces.
- 40. Measures that had been taken over the last two and a half years to reduce energy consumption in Cleveland Police buildings have included:
  - a) Installation of electricity transformers (which ensure a constant current) in four buildings. This has resulted in savings of 8-12% on energy used. These have a short payback time and the benefits are already being recognised.
  - b) Ensuring that computers are switched off when not in use. Software is being commissioned to assist with this.
  - c) A Carbon Management Plan and Energy Strategy is being developed.
  - d) It has been proposed that energy reduction performance targets are introduced. This is to be in the form of internal benchmarking to allow individual districts to be aware of how they are performing against each other. Results will form part of the monthly performance report to Cleveland Police Executive. It is recognised that there is a need to engage all police officers (who may formerly have had the view that energy saving is a non-operational matter) in this issue.
  - e) Various emails, poster campaigns and workshops have previously been used to raise staff awareness. This has achieved a saving of approximately 5% in energy costs. However, there is recognition that this may need to be revisited in the near future to ensure that the objectives continue to remain visible to all.
  - f) Where possible, the Estates Team is keen to promote energy reduction in terms of resources - for example by highlighting that savings from reducing heating levels could equate to a Police Officer post or provision of support services such as dogs or horses. Temperatures in buildings have been turned down to between 19C and 21C and guards are used on thermostats to ensure a constant, comfortable temperature.

- g) Heating and lighting have been reduced at Ladgate Lane Headquarters as it was ascertained that, in some areas, these were in constant use, even when not required. Timings have been altered so that heating and lighting are now switched off in areas that are not in use. In addition, in some cases, thermostats and boiler rooms have been locked and made inaccessible.
- h) Buildings are heated between October and May, although in the colder weather of summer 2012, requests were received to provide heating at Ladgate Lane which costs approximately £1,100 per week.
- i) Air conditioning units have been de-commissioned where opening windows is possible.
- j) The purchase and use of a lux meter (for measuring lighting levels) has produced savings of approximately £6,000 in its first year by removing some lighting tubes.
- 41. During the panel's discussion, reference was also made to the following energy reduction and environmental issues concerning Cleveland Police:
  - a) Any savings on energy reduction are returned to centralised budgets.
  - b) In terms of possible use of forms of renewable energy, it was advised that a costing exercise has been undertaken regarding the viability of photo-voltaic panels for three buildings. This concluded that, due to the considerable reduction in returns from the feed-in tariff (and resultant extension in payback time to 20-25 years), this is not currently a viable option, although its future use has not been discounted. It is also considered that wind power would not produce a large enough output and would be difficult to install. The use of rainwater harvesting and ground source heat pumps may be incorporated in future developments.
  - c) Energy and carbon reduction issues were taken into consideration in planning and building the new police station at St Hilda's. Although this is the responsibility of a separate team within the police service, all new assets and refurbishment of assets, are subject to a sustainability appraisal to ensure minimisation of energy use and carbon emissions and to ensure value for money. The Estates Team has been actively involved in the new-build Police station at Wynyard and the refurbished station at Hartlepool to ensure energy efficiency measures are implemented. Particular difficulties have been encountered in respect of open plan offices - for example part of an office might be occupied by staff working from 9.00am to 5.00pm, while another part may be used by staff working 24 hours. The possibility of relocating all 24 hour operations to the same location is to be explored.

#### **South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust**

42. Information was submitted by the representative of the South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust in respect of energy and carbon reduction as shown below.

- 43. The Trust's Energy and Sustainability Advisor had made available its Carbon Management Plan in advance of the meeting and this was circulated to all scrutiny panel members. The Plan covers the James Cook University Hospital and the Friarage Hospital, Northallerton.
- 44. The Carbon Management Plan highlights where investment is needed and outlines the future vision and targets for the NHS Trust to become a leader in carbon management. The Panel was advised that, since 2010 the Trust has worked in partnership with the Carbon Trust to realise substantial carbon reductions and cost savings. The target is to reduce carbon by 25% by 2015 with potential financial savings to the organisation of around £2.5 million. A reduction of 7.5% in carbon emissions has been achieved to date.
- 45. As the Trust currently spends around £6m annually on energy at the James Cook site, even a small percentage reduction can generate significant savings.
- 46. Patient care is the organisation's key priority and any savings made from energy reduction are generally diverted into this area. It is therefore important to engage both staff and visitors in energy saving measures.
- 47. Any new builds or refurbishments incorporate energy conservation and sustainability as part of the development. Reference was made to the recent development of a new specialist Oncology building, the Endeavour Unit, at the James Cook site. The building includes a ground source heat pump, with heating and lighting controlled by a computerised Building Management System. The building also benefits from having south-facing windows.
- 48. The Panel was shown a thermal imaging aerial photograph of the James Cook hospital site which has recently been produced. This illustrates and highlights heat loss from the buildings and will be used to address areas where energy is being lost.
- 49. Several projects relating to energy reduction and environmental sustainability have either been undertaken recently or are ongoing. These include:
  - a) A staff awareness campaign on energy reduction. This covers both the workplace and the home on the basis that if staff can be encouraged to save energy at home, the resulting changes in thinking and attitude will also benefit the Foundation Trust. The Trust employs approximately 10,000 personnel, including community staff. The majority of staff work daytime hours and the majority of staff offices etc are empty after 7.00pm. It is acknowledged that it is a major challenge to focus all staff on energy reduction and that staff may not regard this as a priority. In the near future, each department will be asked to nominate an Energy Champion in an attempt to progress this issue it has been estimated that turning off lights in empty rooms 'after hours' could save £15,000 per year.
  - b) Procurement of 'Nightwatchman' software. This is a relatively inexpensive programme that ensures that computer equipment is turned off after 7.00pm in non-clinical areas. Although the software costs around £10,000, it is estimated that the payback time could be as little as six months.
  - c) Improvements to external car park lighting through LED lighting replacement. This will provide savings on energy usage and repairs/maintenance.

- d) An external consultant was employed for 60 days to identify where lights and computers etc had been left switched on unnecessarily. This exercise identified that a saving of approximately £50,000 per year could be made by turning off lights and PCs when not needed. The findings have been broken down on a departmental basis and each department has been provided with a list of action areas.
- e) Electrical power sockets (costing £1.00 each) are available that cut off the energy supply to any electrical equipment connected to it once a computer has been turned off. The possibility of procuring these is being explored.
- f) Research is being undertaken on the feasibility of the future use of biomass boilers at both the James Cook and Friarage hospital sites.
- g) The Trust is currently exploring the possibility of including energy reduction responsibilities within employees' job descriptions.
- h) An Environmental Policy is being prepared, for implementation in 2013.
- i) An annual report is to be produced on energy usage.
- j) Recycling is to be extended to clinical areas (but will not include clinical/ contaminated waste).
- k) Battery recycling has been introduced. This is a low-cost initiative that incurred a £50 set up charge and which involves the free collection of bagged batteries by an external company.
- I) The possibility of introducing an offensive waste stream is being examined. Offensive waste, such as nappies and non-clinical sanitary waste, is currently disposed of in the same way as clinical waste. As this is three times more expensive than disposing of ordinary waste, it is planned to stream offensive waste into the normal waste stream for disposal via the Energy From Waste plant at Haverton Hill.
- m) Autoclave replacement: It was explained that the hospital currently has two autoclaves, which are machines used to sterilise infectious waste for disposal via the clinical waste stream. The contracts for both of these machines are due for renewal at a cost of approximately £200,000. The Foundation Trust is examining whether the process is still necessary as the company that disposes of the waste has confirmed that it can now be transported directly to the plant for disposal in an untreated state.
- 50. In addition to the above, it was noted that the potential of installing renewable forms of energy on the hospital sites, such as ground source heat pumps, solar panels etc has not been explored in any detail by the Trust. The scrutiny panel was advised that this is because the James Cook site has been funded as a Pprivate finance initiative (PFI) there are restrictions in terms of what they are permitted to do. Also, other factors, such as infection control, need to be taken into consideration. The organisation's current priority is to raise staff awareness in relation to saving energy.

## Additional Information

51. At the scrutiny Panel's last meeting on this topic, officers from the Council's Neighbourhoods and Communities Department provided an update on ongoing work on energy reduction in Middlesbrough Council. It was indicated that grants could be available for local authorities and other large organisations to fund energy reduction measures, including photo-voltaic systems and insulation works.

## CONCLUSIONS

- 52. Having considered the submitted information, the Environment Scrutiny Panel reached the following conclusions:
  - 1. Middlesbrough Council's role as a Community Champion is well recognised. The scrutiny panel considers that this provides the authority with the opportunity to lead on energy reduction locally and encourage further progress in this area.
  - 2. In the light of ever-increasing energy costs and difficult economic circumstances, energy reduction in both public and private sector businesses has assumed increased importance. In this context, the Environment Scrutiny Panel is pleased to hear of the ongoing work in the local organisations that it spoke to in respect of energy and carbon reduction, with each organisation providing good examples of initiatives that have been used to reduce energy usage. Given the large-scale energy use of the bodies concerned, the work undertaken to date reflects a welcome local commitment, which is to the credit of the organisations concerned.
  - 3. There are opportunities for local organisations to work together, for mutual benefit, on energy reduction. For example, and in the wider context, the Council is already involved with Middlesbrough Environment City in issues such as One Planet Living.
  - 4. Based on the submitted evidence and information, education and cultural changes within each organisation are pre-requisites of meeting future targets on energy reduction. This needs to involve every employee and must also be supported by a commitment at the highest level of the organisation the switch on the wall is important but the switch in people's minds is the key. The leadership at the top of all organisations will be important in ensuring future success.
  - 5. The authority currently faces very difficult choices in respect of its budget position. However, an invest to save approach in areas such as the use of photo-voltaic systems (solar panels), and/or other renewable energy generation systems, would produce both financial and environmental benefits in the longer term.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

53. Following the submitted evidence, and based on the conclusions above, the scrutiny panel's recommendations for consideration by the Overview and Scrutiny board and the Executive are as follows:

- That Middlesbrough Council leads on establishing a Joint Energy Reduction Partnership. This should initially involve the organisations that have contributed to the scrutiny exercise, although the possibility of including neighbouring local authorities in due course should also be examined. The partnership should meet once or twice a year to share information and examples of best practice on energy reduction. It should also explore the possibility of collective purchasing of energy in order to determine whether this approach could be used to reduce costs. Middlesbrough Environment City should also be invited to contribute to the process.
- That, through electronic bulletins, staff inductions, team meetings and any other appropriate methods, the Council regularly highlights and publicises to all staff the cost of energy used, targets for reduction and the part that all employees can play in delivering such reductions. The necessary change of culture in the authority should be progressed via strong leadership.
- 3. The feasibility of the Council adopting an invest to save approach in the use of renewable energy, in particular photovoltaic systems (solar panels), should be examined, including whether grant funding can be obtained for such schemes. The authority should also explore all methods of energy reduction as demonstrated/evidenced by the organisations involved in the scrutiny exercise.

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 54. The Panel is grateful to the following people, who presented evidence during the course of this investigation:
  - R Cuthbert and D Vipond Teesside University
  - G Field Middlesbrough Council
  - S Granger Fabrick Housing Group
  - S Leng and R Marron Cleveland Police
  - M Shepherd Middlesbrough Council
  - R Sisodiya South Tees Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust
  - P Thwaites Middlesbrough Council

#### **BACKGROUND AND REFERENCE MATERIAL**

- 55. The following sources were consulted or referred to in preparing this report:
  - Report to and minutes of the Environment Scrutiny Panel meetings held on 29 August, 10 September, 22 October and 3 December 2012.

#### COUNCILLOR BOB KERR

#### CHAIR OF ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY PANEL

#### January 2013

#### Contact Officer:

Alan Crawford Scrutiny Support Officer Legal & Democratic Services Tel 01642 729707 e-mail: alan\_crawford@middlesbrough.gov.uk